

The Honorable Andrew M. Cuomo
Governor of New York State
NYS State Capitol Building
Albany, NY 12224

Richard Kauffman
Chairman of Energy and Finance
NYS State Capitol Building
Albany, NY 12224

Audrey Zibelman
Chair
NYS Public Service Commission
Three Empire State Plaza
Albany, New York 12223

July 22, 2016

Dear Governor Cuomo, Mr. Kauffman, and Chair Zibelman:

We, the undersigned 111 elected officials and organizations, are deeply concerned about the large sum of money that is now being proposed to subsidize and bail out the nuclear industry through the New York State Clean Energy Standard. Up until two weeks ago, New Yorkers were told that the nuclear subsidy would cost \$270 million over 12 years to support several unprofitable upstate nuclear power plants - namely FitzPatrick, Ginna and Nine Mile Point. Now it has been proposed that New Yorkers will give the nuclear industry nearly \$8 billion to subsidize these power plants in an effort to bail them out from their financial troubles. Residents, businesses, and municipalities across New York will see their electricity bills go up in order to support the nuclear industry while reputable agencies have said we do not need the energy from some of these power plants to supply our state's energy needs.

This is one of the largest corporate bailouts in New York's history and it will benefit only one company, Exelon Corporation. The public has been given only 10 business days to comment on the new version of this nuclear subsidy, apparently because Exelon has said it needs certainty in order to make its business decisions. It is not the role of the public to bail out and pay a corporation to maintain a failing business for their private profit.

The public has been given two reasons for this massive nuclear bailout: to save nuclear jobs and that fossil fuel use will increase if the nuclear plants shut down. Yet available information reveals that these concerns may be unfounded. The \$7.6 billion sum is an extraordinary amount of ratepayers' money to support approximately 2,000 jobs, and in fact many of those nuclear jobs - approximately half of these jobs - could continue for years after the plants have closed because there is significant cleanup, dismantlement, and waste management work to be done even after a plant retires. What's more, putting that money toward renewable energy and energy efficiency would create many, many more jobs.

Regarding energy reliability and fossil fuel use, the New York Independent System Operator (NYISO), the agency responsible for ensuring a reliable electricity supply, has determined that the FitzPatrick and Ginna nuclear plants can shut down immediately with no reliability impacts and no need for new coal or gas power plants. Meanwhile, energy efficiency and wind can already be purchased for less than the price that Exelon is demanding to keep its plants in business.

The sudden new proposal to increase and lock in \$7.6 billion in subsidies to nuclear plants for 12 years is being rushed forward with very little explanation. We are alarmed. New Yorkers deserve a full accounting of this proposal. Please see the questions below that we, residents, organizations and elected officials, have about this massive nuclear subsidy and bailout. Until these questions are answered, the Public Service Commission should not move forward with a vote on the Nuclear Tier of the Clean Energy Standard proceeding.

1. How much will this nuclear subsidy impact electricity bills? Please provide details on the increased cost for residents, businesses, and municipalities.

2. What is the basis for saying that we need this energy from nuclear when the New York State Independent System Operator and other independent experts have determined that both FitzPatrick and Ginna nuclear reactors can close while coal and gas plants also shut down in NY with no threat to the reliability of the electricity system?
3. Has the Department of Public Service (DPS) done an independent analysis to compare the \$7.6 billion cost of bailing out the upstate nuclear reactors to the cost of quickly expanding energy efficiency retrofits and renewable energy? Furthermore, has DPS modeled how many jobs would be created for New Yorkers if the money went to energy efficiency and renewable energy? Please provide this analysis.
4. If renewable energy and energy efficiency options were fast-tracked over the next few years instead of subsidizing the nuclear reactors, what would the overall effect be on New York's greenhouse gas emissions? Please provide this modeling and analysis.
5. To what extent has your Administration negotiated with Exelon Corporation to provide this 12-year, multi-billion-dollar subsidy?
6. The latest nuclear subsidy proposal includes a claim that the upstate nuclear plants provide \$5 billion in benefits to New Yorkers over two years, but provides no detailed explanation of where those benefits come from and to whom they would go. Please provide an accounting of those benefits authored by independent researchers or by government agencies.
7. Have state agencies done any analysis into how much it would cost to re-train nuclear workers in renewable energy and efficiency jobs and/or provide temporary wage assistance instead of subsidizing nuclear power plants?
8. Given that municipalities and school districts with nuclear power plants currently rely on them for municipal tax and school district revenues, has your administration analyzed how the state could aid and support these communities if these nuclear power plants close, similar to what your Administration did with allocating \$30 million in the 2016 NYS budget for large power plant closures? If so, please provide that analysis.

We support your efforts to implement an enforceable renewable energy policy through the proposed Clean Energy Standard. We encourage you to move forward with the Renewable Tiers described in the proposed policy as soon as possible. However, given the concerns that we and others have raised about the Nuclear Tier and the unanswered questions surrounding the nuclear bailout, we strongly urge you to delay a decision on the \$7.6 billion nuclear subsidies until these questions are answered.

Sincerely,

Bruce Mayer
Member, Town Board
Lima, New York

Carissa Parlato
Ulysses Town Clerk
Trumansburg, NY

Carol Chock
Legislator, Tompkins County District Three
Ithaca, NY

Dan Klein “
Tompkins County Legislature Representative
Danby, NY

Doug Bullock
Albany County Legislator
Albany, NY

Elizabeth G. Thomas
Town Supervisor
Town of Ulysses, NY

Gregory Young
Supervisor, Fulton County
Gloversville, NY

Jean Kessner
Syracuse Common Councilor-at-Large
Syracuse, NY

Judd W. Krasher
Common Council Member, 11th Ward
Albany, NY

Mayor Kevin Neary
Village of Richmondville
Richmondville, NY

Michael Kolczynski
Supervisor
Savannah, New York

Richard John
County Legislator
Ithaca, New York

Debra Watkins
Trustee, Village of Trumansburg
Trumansburg, NY

William Reinhardt
Albany County Legislator, District #33
Slingerlands, NY

John G. Hertzler
Board Member of Town of Ulysses
Trumansburg, NY

Edward LeMieux
Supervisor, Town of Duane
Malone, NY

350NYC

Lyna Hinkel, Founding member
New York, NY

All Our Energy
George Povall, Director
Point Lookout, NY

Alliance for a Green Economy
Jessica Azulay, Program Director
Syracuse, NY

Atlantic Chapter of the Sierra Club
Erin Riddle, Chair
Albany, NY

Bergen County Green Party
Ed Fanning, Chair
Dumont, NJ

Beyond Nuclear
Kevin Kamps, Radioactive Waste Specialist and Watchdog
Takoma Park, MD

Binghamton Regional Sustainability Coalition
Adam Flint, Southern Tier Solar Works Program Manager
Binghamton, NY

Campaign for Renewable Energy
Brian Eden, Vice-Chair
Ithaca, NY

Carbon Tax Center
Charles Komanoff, Director
New York, NY

Catskill Mountainkeeper
Wes Gillingham, Program Director
Livingston Manor, NY

CEO Pipe Organs/Golden Ponds Farm
Corey E. Olsen, Owner/Activist
Delafield, Wisconsin

Citizen Action of New York
Kristina Andreotta, Deputy Organizing Director
Albany, NY

Citizens Campaign for the Environment
Brian Smith, Associate Executive Director
Buffalo, NY

Citizens' Environmental Coalition
Barbara Warren, Executive Director
Orange County, NY

Citizens for Local Power
Jen Metzger, Co-Director
Rosendale, NY

Citizens for Renewable Energy (CFRE)
S. Kleinau
Buffalo, NY

Citizens For Water
Joe Levine, Director
New York, NY

Coalition Against Nukes
Priscilla Star, Founder and Director
Wainscott, New York

Coalition Against the Rockaway Pipeline
Judith K. Canepa, Coordinator
New York, NY

Council on Intelligent Energy & Conservation Policy
Michel Lee, Chair
Scarsdale, NY

Damascus Citizens for Sustainability
B. Arrindell, Director
Narrowsburg, NY

Deebege Newe
Ian Zabarte, Secretary
Las Vegas, NV

Dine No Nukes
Tommy Rock, Co-Founder
Albuquerque, NM

Dryden Resource Awareness Coalition
Marie McRae
Dryden, NY

Durham Nuclear Awareness (DNA)
Janet McNeill, Coordinator
Toronto, Ontario

Earth Guardians New York
Rachel Marco-Havens, Co-Director
Woodstock, New York

Eco-Logic, WBAI-FM
Ken Gale, Producer
New York, NY

Environmental Justice Committee, SUNY Cortland
Sheila Cohen, Committee Chair
Cortland, NY

Environmental Justice Task Force of the WNY Peace Center
Charley Bowman, Co-Chair
Buffalo, New York

Food & Water Watch
Alex Beauchamp, Northeast Region Director
Brooklyn, NY

Frack Action
Julia Walsh, Campaign Director
Kingston, NY

Freshwater Future
Jill M Ryan, Executive Director
Petoskey, MI

Good Old Lower East Side (GOLES)
Damaris Reyes, Executive Director
New York, NY

Grassroots Environmental Education
Ellen Weininger
White Plains, NY

Green Education and Legal Fund
Mark Dunlea, Chair
Poestenkill, NY

Green Party of New York State
Howie Hawkins
Syracuse, NY

Green Party of Onondaga
Ursula Rozum
Syracuse, NY

GreeningUSA, Inc.
John Przepiora, President
Syracuse, NY

Greenpeace
Jim Riccio, Nuclear Policy Analyst
Washington, DC

Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, Inc.
Manna Jo Greene, Environmental Director
Beacon, NY

Indian Point Safe Energy Coalition
Gary Shaw, Member of Leadership Council
Ossining, NY

Iroquois of the Sierra Club
Linda A. DeStefano, Conservation Chair
Syracuse, NY

Manhattan Project for a Nuclear-Free World
Mari Inoue
New York, NY

Michigan Safe Energy Future - Shoreline Chapter
Bette Pierman, Chair
Benton Harbor, MI

Mid-Hudson Sierra Club
Joanne Steele, Chair
Poughkeepsie, NY

Minnesota Natural Health Coalition
Lee Beaty, President
Minneapolis, MN

MK Gandhi Institute for Nonviolence
Kit Miller, Director
Rochester, NY

More Sound Recording Studio
Jason Randall, Owner
Syracuse, NY

New York Climate Action Group
Judith K. Canepa, Co-Founder
New York, NY

New York Public Interest Research Group (NYPIRG)
Russ Haven, Legislative Counsel
Albany, NY

New York State Sustainable Business Council
Hillary Baum
Bronx, NY

New Yorkers for Clean Water
Susan Chew, Chairwoman
Staten Island, NY

Nobody Leaves Mid-Hudson
Jonathan Bix, Executive Director
Poughkeepsie, NY

North Country 350 Alliance
Ginger Storey-Welch
Colton, NY

North Country Veterans for Peace
Dale Pondysh
Nicholville, NY

Nuclear Free World Committee of Syracuse Peace Council
Diane R. Swords, Committee Chair
Syracuse, NY

Nuclear Information and Resource Service
Timothy Judson, Executive Director
Takoma Park, MD

NYC Friends of Clearwater
Edie Kantrowitz, President
Brooklyn, NY

NYC Safe Energy Campaign
Ken Gale, Founder
New York, NY

NYH2o
Buck Moorhead, Chair
New York City, NY

Occupy Bergen County
Sally J. Gellert, member
Teaneck, NJ

Ontario Clean Air Alliance
Angela Bischoff, Outreach Director
Toronto, Ontario, Canada

PAUSE - People of Albany United for Safe Energy
Diana Wright, Facilitator
Albany, NY

Peace Action New York State
Jim Anderson, President
New York, NY

Peace Action of Staten Island
Ilya Geller, Co-Chair
Staten Island, NY

Physicians for Social Responsibility - New York
Shannon Gearhart, MD, MPH
New York, NY

People for Animal Rights
Linda A. DeStefano, President
Syracuse, NY

Pilgrim-St. Luke's United Church of Christ
Rev. Justo Gonzalez, II, Pastor
Buffalo, NY

Port Hope Community Health Concerns Committee
Faye More, Chair
Port Hope, Ontario, Canada

Promoting Health and Sustainable Energy
Susan Shapiro, Director
Nanuet, NY

Protect Orange County.org
Randolph Hurst, Co-Chairman
Slate Hill, NY

Psychologists for Social Responsibility -- Environmental Action Group
Dr. Susan Spieler
New York, NY

Public Citizen
Allison Fisher, Outreach Director Public Citizen's Climate and Energy Program
Washington, DC

PUSH Buffalo
Clarke Gocker, Director of Policy and Strategy
Buffalo, NY

Residents Allied for the Future of Tioga (RAFT)
Gerri Wiley
Owego, NY

Rochester People's Climate Coalition
Linda Isaacson Fedele, Leadership Team Member
Rochester, NY

Safe Energy Rights Group, Inc.
Nancy S Vann, President
Peekskill, NY

Sane Energy Project
Kim Fraczek, Co-Director
New York, NY

ShaleshockCNY
Jack Ramsden
Syracuse, NY

Sierra Club Niagara Group
Pamela Hughes, Chair
Williamsville, NY

Stop the Algonquin Pipeline Expansion
Susan Van Dolsen, Cofounder
Rye, NY

Sustainable Cortland
Beth Klein, Board President
Cortland, NY

Sustainable Otsego
Adrian Kuzminski, Moderator
Fly Creek, NY

Sustainable Tompkins
Gay Nicholson, President
Ithaca, NY

Syracuse Community Choir
Karen Mihalyi, Director
Syracuse, NY

Syracuse Cultural Workers
Andy Mager
Syracuse, New York

Syracuse Peace Council
Brian Escobar, Interim Staff Organizer
Syracuse, NY

Syracuse United Neighbors, Inc
Richard Puchalski, Executive Director
Syracuse, NY

The CORA Foundation/ArtRage Gallery
Rose Viviano, Director
Syracuse, NY

The Green Resource Hub of the Finger Lakes
Maribeth Rubenstein, Board President
Ithaca, NY

The Point CDC
Angela Tovar, Director of Community Development
Bronx, NY

United for Action
Ling Tsou
New York, NY

Uranium Watch
Sarah Fields
Moab, UT

UU Binghamton Green Sanctuary
Wes Ernsberger, Chair
Owego, NY

Workers' Center of Central New York
Rebecca Fuentes, Lead Organizer
Syracuse, NY